

THE COUNTY COUNCIL OF THE CITY & COUNTY OF CARDIFF

The County Council of the City & County of Cardiff met at County Hall, Cardiff on 20 October 2016 to transact the business set out in the Council summons dated 14 October 2016.

Present: County Councillor Walsh (Lord Mayor of City & County of Cardiff).

County Councillors Ali Ahmed, Aubrey, Bale, Bowden, Boyle, Bradbury, Bridges, Carter, Chaundy, Clark, Richard Cook, Cowan, De'Ath, Derbyshire, Elsmore, Evans, Ford, Goddard, Goodway, Gordon, Graham, Hill-John, Hinchey, Howells, Hudson, Hunt, Hyde, Keith Jones, Margaret Jones, Joyce, Kelloway, Knight, Lent, Lloyd, Marshall, McEvoy, McGarry, McKerlich, Merry, Michael, Mitchell, Murphy, Parry, Patel, Phillips, Dianne Rees, Robson, Sanders, Simmons, Stubbs, Thomas, Ben Thomas, Graham Thomas, Lynda Thorne, Walker, Weaver, White, Wild, Darren Williams and Woodman

83 : APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE

Apologies for absence had been received from Councillors Manzoor Ahmed, Dilwar Ali, Burfoot, Ralph Cook, Kirsty Davies-Warner, Chris Davis, Govier, Groves, Holden, Magill, Derrick Morgan and David Rees.

84 : DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST

The following declarations of interest were declared: -

<u>Councillor</u>	<u>Interest</u>
Councillor Ali Ahmed	Item 7: Supplementary Planning Guidance – Houses in Multiple Occupation – Personal interest in an HMO.
Councillor Hudson	Item 6 : City of Cardiff Council Annual Improvement Report and Item 9: Cabinet Member Health, Housing and wellbeing Statement - Personal interest as family member in receipt of Disabled Facilities.
Councillor Kelloway	Item 7: Supplementary Planning Guidance – Houses in Multiple Occupation – Personal interest in an HMO.
Councillor Woodman	Item 9: Cabinet Member Health, Housing and Wellbeing Statement - Personal interest a Member of the Management Board of the Goldies Cymru Charity.

85 : MINUTES

The minutes of the meeting of Council on 28 July 2016 were approved as a correct record and signed by the Chairperson.

86 : PETITIONS

1. Councillor Marshall – 334 signatures hard copy petition and 2500 on-line petition which was still open calling on the Council not to close Cardiff Central Sport and Community Centre in Ocean Park.

2. Councillor Cowan – 10 signatures seeking clarification and confirmation that the Duke of Edinburgh scheme will continue at Gabalfa Youth Centre for both Silver and Gold Awards.
3. Councillor Diane Rees – 545 signatures calling on the Council to acknowledge the parking problems in Pontprennau and produce an effective strategy to prevent those problems.

87 : LORD MAYOR'S ANNOUNCEMENTS

The Lord Mayor made the following announcement to Council:

The 21 October 2016 marks the 50th Anniversary of the Aberfan Disaster and the Lord Mayor on behalf of the Council advised that as a mark of respect and in commemoration of the event all Members and staff would be asked to pause for a minute silence at 9.15am tomorrow the exact time that the disaster occurred.

The Lord Mayor congratulated teams on their achievements this month as follows.

School Holiday Enrichment Programme is a scheme that provides nutritious meals, sport and learning to children living in socially deprived areas of the city, has received another award at the “Edu-catering Awards.” This is the fifth award for the project this year.

Keep Roath Tidy scheme was shortlisted in the best partnership category at the recent Local Authority Recycling Advisory Committee, or LARAC award. The judging panel was hugely impressed by the innovative ideas and hard work that recycling officers continue to demonstrate on a daily basis.

Fitness Instructor Phil Carleton, senior fitness instructor at Maindy Centre has been successful in his bid to become powerlifting World Champion.

St David's Hall has been ranked in the Top Ten best-sounding concert halls in the World. According to a study by acoustic expert Leo L. Beranek St David's Hall is ranked 9th and beats world-famous venues such as the Royal Albert Hall and the Sydney Opera House. The city can feel proud that Cardiff has one of the best-sounding concert halls in the world.

Congratulations to Councillor Judith Woodman who became a grandmother for the first time in the early hours of 30 September. Our best wishes to Councillor Woodman, her son, daughter-in-law and new grandson Maelon, Alfie.

The Lord Mayor was delighted to announce that donations and collections for the Lord Mayor's Charity my Charity Cancer Research Wales have reached £8,500 which included £472.36 raised at the occasion wear clothing donation day prior to last month's Council.

In addition, Councillor Dilwar Ali fund-raising towards his May 2017 Walk the Wall in China Trek has now hit £3745, and the Lord Mayor thanked all those who have donated to his just giving site so far.

The Lord Mayor was also delighted to attend the Muslim Council of Wales event on Monday 17 October at which many generous donations were received for the Charity, and she thanked them very much for contributions.

The Lord Mayor was pleased to announce that the following events arranged:

- the Lord Mayor's Curry Night hosted by Councillors Dilwar Ali and Susan White on 20 November 2016 at Llandaff North Rugby Club; and
- Christmas Coffee morning at the Mansion House on Wednesday 14 December 2016.

The Lord Mayor was pleased to advise that as part of Pancreatic Cancer Awareness month in November the Council will be lighting up the Castle and City Hall in purple to mark this important awareness campaign.

88 : CITY OF CARDIFF COUNCIL STATUTORY IMPROVEMENT REPORT 2015-16

The Cabinet Member for Corporate Services and Performance proposed the Council's Annual Statutory Improvement Plan for approval by Council. This proposal was seconded by Councillor Bale.

The report was a retrospective summary evaluation of performance for 2015-16 providing the Council's performance against agreed outcomes and improvement objectives and targets. The Cabinet Member was pleased to report improvements in performance in 70% of our National Performance Indicators compared to 47.7% in 2014-15. Performance in 2015-16 exceeds the all-Wales improvement of 65% and this makes the Council the third most improved Local Authority in Wales.

The Council was also making significant progress on a programme of work to further develop and support the embedding of its performance management framework to effect business planning and improvements to performance reporting. A key part of this Performance Management Framework is the development of a consistent approach to setting targets for performance indicators across the Council, ensuring targets that are both realistic and sufficiently challenging.

The Cabinet Member reported positive feedback from the statutory regulators. Estyn in its report in March 2016 had deemed that the Council had made sufficient progress that it did not require further Estyn monitoring. In addition the Care and Social Services Inspectorate Wales (CSSIW) of Children's Services in City of Cardiff Council, March 2016 reported that the Council's Elected Members and Management team had demonstrated a common understanding of the direction and drive needed to ensure Social Services effectively supported improved outcomes for children and young people in Cardiff, and that partnership agencies are engaged strategically and there was evidence of a greater understanding of the complex issues facing the Council.

The Wales Audit Office had concluded in its follow-on report that the Council had achieved a step change in delivering improved outcomes and addressing outstanding issues. The Council's Annual Statutory Improvement Report will be audited by the Wales Audit Office in November 2016.

The Council continued to work with the Policy Review & Performance Scrutiny Committee in reviewing and scrutinising performance.

These improvements had been made within the context of ever increasing demands on services; increases in population and during a very challenging financial period where significant budget savings of £113m had been achieved.

The Lord Mayor invited debate on the report and Councillor Hinchey responded to observations and comments raised in the debate by Members in relation to key priorities; budgetary and savings pressures; demand on services; the upskilling of the workforce; provision of neighbourhood and direct services to communities; increases funding for disabled facility grants; and driving forward on attendance and sickness performance.

RESOLVED - That the City of Cardiff Council Annual Statutory Improvement Report be approved for publication by 31 October 2016.

89 : SUPPLEMENTARY PLANNING GUIDANCE

The Council received for approval draft Supplementary Planning Guidance (SPG) on Houses in Multiple Occupation and Waste Collection and Storage Facilities which help to deliver the Liveable City agenda, bring about positive improvements to neighbourhoods.

The Cabinet Member, Transport, Planning & Sustainability Councillor Patel proposed the SPG Houses in Multiple Occupation, which was seconded by Councillor Michael.

The SPG provides the Council with the tools to deal with the growth of Houses of Multiple Occupation (HMO) and manage future developments in order to retain balanced housing mix in its communities to avoid negative consequences associated with such developments and provide a high standard of development

The SPG was subject to public consultation in May 2016, and a wide range of comments were received, which have been addressed in the SPG report and lead to some changes to the final SPG.

The Lord Mayor invited debate on the SPG Houses of Multiple Occupation (HMO) and a number of issues were raised around the consultation process in particular discussions with key stakeholders; increasing growth of HMO's; impact on communities and isolation of groups in communities; the robustness of the SPG and need for SPG to support and enhance the policies contained in the Local development Plan.

As part of the debate a Motion without notice under Council Procedure Rules 25 (a) (iv) to refer the report back to Cabinet was proposed by Councillor Carter and seconded by Councillor Boyle.

The Cabinet Member, Environment Councillor Derbyshire proposed the SPG Waste Collection and Storage Facilities Houses in Multiple Occupation, which was seconded by Councillor Michael.

The Waste SPG outlines the minimum requirements for waste storage, collection and presentation for all new developments (commercial and domestic) and replaces previous SPG which was out of date with the current waste collection methods and the storage requirements for new developments.

The main changes were to update the storage requirements for all residential dwellings based on the recent collection changes, particularly the sizes of residual waste bins required; clarified the bin provision and storage requirements 1 or 2 bed flats; makes direct reference to houses converted to flats, and the requirement for waste to be storage in an external area and the need for designated storage area for bulky waste for all purpose built flat developments. In addition the SPG provides specific guidance and considerations for developers of new properties.

The Cabinet Member advised that comments received from Councillors and stakeholders were set out in the report.

The Lord Mayor invited debate during which observations were made about sizes of bins; and requirements for larger families. In general, Members welcomed this SPG in particular the guidance to developers about future requirements.

At the end of the debate a vote was taken on the Motion to reference back the SPG for Houses in Multiple Occupation by a show of hands. The reference back was LOST.

The recommendations of the report were put to the vote and the recommendations were agreed.

RESOLVED – That the Houses in Multiple Occupation and Waste Collection and Storage Facilities Supplementary Planning Guidance were approved.

90 : MEMBER CHAMPION ANNUAL REPORTS

The Council received the second written Annual Reports from the Member Champion for Equalities and Diversity, Councillor Ali Ahmed; the Member Champion for Community Food Growing, Councillor Gareth Holden; and the Member Champion Cycling and Sustainable Transport, Councillor Iona Gordon setting out activities, successes and suggestions for the future work to optimise the impact on the overall subject area and the work of individual Champions.

Councillor Ali Ahmed presented his report. Members welcomed the work being undertaken on the promotion and support to encourage diversity of Elected Members and it was noted that Councillor Bowden, Cowan and Ali Ahmed had been mentors to individuals who had an interest in standing for election in the future.

Councillor Holden was not present and his report was noted.

Councillor Gordon presented her report and in response to observations made agreed to follow up on the employee cycle purchase scheme. Members noted that the work of all the Member Champions was ongoing.

RESOLVED – That

- (1) the Annual reports from the Member Champion for Equalities and Diversity,; the Member Champion for Community Food Growing, and the Member Champion Cycling and Sustainable Transport were received and noted and the Members were commended on the good work undertaken during the last 12 months;
- (2) the three Member Champion roles be approved until the end of the 2016-17 Municipal year and be reviewed by the new administration.

91 : STATEMENTS

Leader Statement and Economic Development & Partnerships

The Leader provided a statement on the Cardiff Convention 2016; Bilingual Cardiff: Five Year Strategy; Cardiff Contemporary; European Local Democracy Week, 10-16 October 2016; Apprenticeships and the commemoration of the 50th Anniversary of the Aberfan Disaster

The Leader responded to questions on the Cardiff Convention; apprenticeships and the Bilingual Cardiff: Five Year Strategy. The Leader indicated that he would provide Members with the outcomes from the Cardiff Convention.

Environment Statement

The Cabinet Member provided a statement on Parks; Bereavement Services; Cardiff Dogs Home RSPCA Footprint Gold Award Ceremony for the work undertaken with stray dogs and their welfare; Waste and Recycling; and Neighbourhood Services.

The Cabinet Member responded matters raised around litter picking; recycling; street cleansing; blitz teams; apprenticeships; enforcement waste collection; issuing of fines; and staff resources.

The Cabinet Member undertook to provide information to the Member on the number of fines issued and number of waste enforcement officers employed by the Council.

Health, Housing & Wellbeing Statement

The Cabinet Member provided a statement on Partnership with Health – Wales Audit Office (WAO) Thematic Review; Unaccompanied Asylum Seeking Children; Golden-Oldies Cymru; Second Annual Tenant Participation Conference; and Preventative Services.

The Cabinet Member responded to matters raised around the support to be given to unaccompanied children and the co-ordinated approach being taken in Cardiff and the support being sought and offered by neighbouring Welsh authorities. The Cabinet Member assured Council of the partnership arrangements and preventative work being undertaken to support the most vulnerable in Cardiff and more importantly working with their needs to ensure the best possible outcome.

Corporate Services & Performance Statement

The Cabinet Member provided a statement on Government Opportunities (GO) Excellence in Public Procurement Awards Wales for 2016/17; the Living Wage; work of the City of Cardiff Council Academy; the Love Where You Live Campaign; C2C services; Migration of Good email users to new system; and SOCITM Award for Phil Bear, ICT Service Manager.

The Cabinet Member responded to issues raised around the service provision to Welsh speakers. He invited the new Councillor to visit C2C to see how it operates.

Deputy Leader and Cabinet Member for Early Years, Children & Families

The Deputy Leader provided a statement on the work of Children's Services in supporting the national response to the facilitation of the urgent transfer to the UK of asylum seeking children from the camp in Calais. Cardiff will play an appropriate role in response to this humanitarian crisis. Over the past week officers have been working intensively with the Home Office, WLGA and partners to put in place a Council-led, multi-directorate and multi-agency response to facilitate the immediate reception of a number of unaccompanied children from the Calais camp.

The safety and wellbeing of the children is our primary concern. We understand that most of these children will have relatives in the UK. It is expected that they will be placed with relatives as soon as possible in other local authority areas across England and Wales, once those local authorities have completed the necessary arrangements.

Members welcomed the Deputy Leader's statement.

92 : MOTION 1

The Lord Mayor advised that a notice of motion proposed by Councillor Dianne Rees and seconded by Councillor Robson had been received and was included on the Summons for the meeting.

The Notice of Motion as proposed by Councillor Dianne Rees was as follows:

This Council notes that:

- There have been a number of unauthorised travellers camps set up in Cardiff Council parks and open spaces.
- When an eviction notice is served on unauthorised camps by Cardiff Council, the notice only excludes campers from returning to the Council open space or park they are currently operating in for three months.
- Some unauthorised camps leave rubbish and cause damage to the park and open space they set up in. This then has to be cleansed and repaired, normally at a cost to the taxpayer.

This Council calls on the Cabinet to:

1. Examine the legal notice served on unauthorised camps in Cardiff with a view that the notice should be extended to prevent a return to all Council owned parks and open spaces.
2. Explore whether the notice can be extended to prevent a return for a period of six months.
3. Consider a mechanism for taking civil action to recover the Council's losses.

Councillor Robson as the seconder deferred to speak later in the debate.

The Lord Mayor advised that there were no amendments to this motion.

The Lord Mayor invited debate on the motion. During the debate a Motion without notice was moved by Councillor Hunt and seconded by Councillor Ben Thomas under Council Procedure Rule 25 (a) (ix) that the question be put.

The Lord Mayor in accordance with her discretion called for the vote on the motion without notice that the question be put.

A request for a recorded vote was received in accordance with Council Procedure Rule 29 (d).

For (45): Councillors Ali Ahmed, Aubrey, Bale, Boyle, Bradbury, Bridges, Carter, Chaundy, Clark, Richard Cook, Derbyshire, Elsmore, Evans, Goddard, Goodway, Gordon, Hinchey, Howells, Hunt, Hyde, Keith Jones, Margaret Jones, Joyce, Knight, Lent, McGarry, Merry, Michael, Mitchell, Murphy, Parry, Patel, Phillips, Rea, Sanders, Simmons, Stubbs, Ben Thomas, Huw Thomas, Thorne, Weaver, White, Wild, Darren Williams and Woodman

Against (10): Councillors Cowan, Graham, Hill-John, Hudson, Kelloway, McKerlich, Dianne Rees, Robson, Graham Thomas and Walker

Abstain (1): Councillor Lloyd.

The Vote for the Motion that the question be put was CARRIED.

The Lord mayor invited the right of reply from the proposer of the motion Councillor Dianne Rees prior to a vote being taken on the Motion.

A recorded vote was requested.

For (9): Councillors Cowan, Graham, Hill-John, Hudson, McKerlich, Dianne Rees, Robson, Graham Thomas and Walker.

Against (45): Councillors Ali Ahmed, Aubrey, Bale, Boyle, Bradbury, Bridges, Carter, Chaundy, Clark, Richard Cook, Derbyshire, Elsmore, Evans, Goddard, Goodway, Gordon, Hinchey, Howells, Hunt, Hyde, Keith Jones, Margaret Jones, Joyce, Kelloway, Knight, Lent, Merry, Michael, Mitchell, Murphy, Parry, Patel, Phillips, Rea, Sanders, Simmons,

Stubbs, Ben Thomas, Huw Thomas, Thorne, White, Wild,
Darren Williams and Woodman.

Abstain (1): Councillor Lloyd.

The Motion was LOST.

93 : MOTION 2

The Lord Mayor advised that a notice of motion proposed by Councillor Darren Williams and seconded by Councillor Joyce had been received and was included on the Summons for the meeting.

The Notice of Motion was as follows:

This Council:

- Notes that since 2010 wages have gone down in real terms, whilst prices have continued to rise, which has put increasing financial pressure on many hard working families in Cardiff.
- Deplores the Conservatives' rebranding of the National Minimum Wage, as the National Living Wage, in an effort to hoodwink people into believing that they are getting a pay rise.
- Celebrates that since September 2012 this Labour Council has paid a real Living Wage, as defined by the Living Wage Foundation, to all its employees. In April 2015, we became the first Welsh Council to be an accredited Living Wage Employer, and to encourage all contractors working for the Council to also pay their staff a living wage.
- Recognises that many companies and third sector bodies, of all sizes, across Cardiff support their staff by paying a Real Living Wage.

We therefore call on

- (1) this Council to promote Cardiff as a Living Wage City by encouraging, and supporting, businesses and charities who wish to take part in the Living Wage Foundation scheme; and
- (2) the Leader of the Council writes to the Labour Welsh Government to explore ways of encouraging other employers across the City to sign up to paying a Real Living Wage.

The Lord Mayor advised that one amendment to this Motion had been received proposed by Councillor Walker and seconded by Councillor Cowan

The amendment was as follows:

Delete first two bullet points and replace with: -

- *Notes that in July 2015 the national Conservative government announced a compulsory living wage from April 2016 of £ 7.20 an hour which will increase annually. Advised by the Low Wage Commission this hourly rate is predicted to rise to £9 or more by 2020.*

This new living wage is 7.5% higher than the minimum wage existing at the time of the announcement.

- *Notes that the Consumer Price Index (CPI) rise in the year September 2015 to 2016 was 0.6%. Those on low pay therefore experienced a real increase in their wage packets and pay no tax on the first £11,000 of their income*

Amend third bullet point by:

- (i) First sentence delete all words after 2012 and replace with '*when a proposal to Council was supported by all political parties, this authority has paid a Living Wage to all its employees.*'
- (ii) Second sentence delete the word 'we' and replace with '*Cardiff*'
- (iii) 4th line before the word 'encourage' insert the word '*first.*'

The substantive motion would then read:

This Council:

- Notes that in July 2015 the national Conservative government announced a compulsory living wage from April 2016 of £ 7.20 an hour which will increase annually. Advised by the Low Wage Commission this hourly rate is predicted to rise to £9 or more by 2020.

This new living wage is 7.5% higher than the minimum wage existing at the time of the announcement.

- Notes that the Consumer Price Index (CPI) rise in the year September 2015 to 2016 was 0.6%. Those on low pay therefore experienced a real increase in their wage packets and pay no tax on the first £11,000 of their income.
- Celebrates that since September 2012, when a proposal to Council was supported by all political parties, this authority has paid a Living Wage to all its employees. In April 2015, Cardiff became the first Welsh Council to be an accredited Living Wage Employer and the first to encourage all contractors working for the Council to also pay their staff a living wage.
- Recognises that many companies and third sector bodies, of all sizes, across Cardiff support their staff by paying a Real Living Wage.

We therefore call on

- (3) this Council to promote Cardiff as a Living Wage City by encouraging, and supporting, businesses and charities who wish to take part in the Living Wage Foundation scheme; and
- (4) the Leader of the Council write to the Labour Welsh Government to explore ways of encouraging other employers across the City to sign up to paying a Real Living Wage.

The Lord Mayor invited debate on the motion. At the conclusion of the debate the Lord Mayor invited Councillor Williams to sum up.

The Lord Mayor asked for a vote to be taken on the Amendment proposed by Councillor Walker.

The vote was **LOST**.

The Lord Mayor called for a vote on the motion as proposed by Councillor Williams

The Motion was **CARRIED** as follows:

This Council:

- Notes that since 2010 wages have gone down in real terms, whilst prices have continued to rise, which has put increasing financial pressure on many hard working families in Cardiff.
- Deplores the Conservatives' rebranding of the National Minimum Wage, as the National Living Wage, in an effort to hoodwink people into believing that they are getting a pay rise.
- Celebrates that since September 2012 this Labour Council has paid a real Living Wage, as defined by the Living Wage Foundation, to all its employees. In April 2015, we became the first Welsh Council to be an accredited Living Wage Employer, and to encourage all contractors working for the Council to also pay their staff a living wage.
- Recognises that many companies and third sector bodies, of all sizes, across Cardiff support their staff by paying a Real Living Wage.

We therefore call on

- (5) this Council to promote Cardiff as a Living Wage City by encouraging, and supporting, businesses and charities who wish to take part in the Living Wage Foundation scheme; and
- (6) the Leader of the Council write to the Labour Welsh Government to explore ways of encouraging other employers across the City to sign up to paying a Real Living Wage.

94 : ORAL QUESTIONS

Question: *County Councillor Clark*

Key Policy 17 of Cardiff's 2016 Local Development Plan says, "*Cardiff's distinctive heritage assets will be protected, managed and enhanced, in particular the character and setting of its Scheduled Ancient Monuments, Listed Buildings, Registered Historic Landscapes, Parks and Gardens, Conservation Areas, Locally Listed Buildings and other features of local interest that positively contribute to the distinctiveness of the city*".

Can the people of Cardiff be assured that the heritage of this city is safe in this administration's hands by keeping to this commitment including with regard to our Victorian and Edwardian buildings in Conservation areas?

Reply: *County Councillor Patel*

The protection and enhancement of the heritage of our built environment is a priority for the Council.

Supplementary question: *County Councillor Clark*

I'm really concerned that you haven't given an unequivocal "yes" to my question. The Liberal Democrats protected our heritage well. For example, we restored the Cathays Chapels, the Melingriffith Pump, the Castle animal wall, and opened the Cardiff Story.

However, under Labour, the Coal Exchange condition has declined; the Splott University settlement and the Poet's Corner have been demolished when more effort should have been put into listing them locally. And all Council support has been withdrawn from the conservation groups so it is more difficult to protect our conservation areas.

Will you agree that this administration's past record on our heritage has been woeful?

Reply: *County Councillor Patel*

I certainly do not agree with you.

And let me get some facts correct: - It was the Liberal Democrat administration that completely failed on the Local Development Plan (LDP) and did not put any protection in. I am therefore not going to be lectured by you or anybody else saying about putting the protection in. Just like your party didn't do anything about Houses in Multiple Occupation (HMOs) in Cathays and Plasnewydd or anything for the heritage, either.

Supplementary question: *County Councillor Stubbs*

Do you agree with me that the local Labour Councillors put up a real fight to save the University settlement and that planning isn't a political issue; and to suggest that the Planning Committee is political in any way is erring on the dangerous?

Reply: *County Councillor Patel*

I certainly do, and I think Councillor Clark should be apologising to the Planning Committee for the outrageous comments she's made.

Personal explanation (Rule 11 (i): *County Councillor Clark*

Councillor Clark indicated that she had not alluded in her question to the Planning Committee and that she was aware that Councillor Michael, Chair of Planning Committee was keen not to involve politics in the committee business.

Question: *County Councillor Walker*

Your motion at Council refers to the cost of living pressures experienced by the low paid. Yet every year since becoming Leader you have increased the level of Council Tax by the maximum permitted, with increases higher than many other Councils in the UK. In recognising that the lowest paid suffer most from such tax increases there is a massive contradiction between your actions in power and your group's political posturing and publically voiced complaints. Will you therefore commit to ensuring that, in the upcoming budget, you seek ways to keep council taxes low and avoid again hitting the lowest earners the hardest?

Reply: *County Councillor Bale*

Your statement that the level of Council Tax has increased by the maximum is simply not correct. The increase for the current financial year was broadly in line with the average increase across Wales and, of course, unlike in England, there is no centrally dictated "maximum" in relation to Council Tax here in Wales. UK Government figures show that 77%, that's 134 out of 174 Local Authorities in England and Wales actually increased the average Band D Council Tax by more than Cardiff in the current financial year.

And as Members will know, the Conservative Group has repeatedly called for lower Council Tax increases, but has refused to say what Council services they would cut instead. This Labour administration will continue to protect vital services to the people of Cardiff, services which the low paid and vulnerable rely upon.

We are not only a Living Wage employer, but have also continued to support and protect the Council Tax Reduction Scheme, which is designed to support those on low incomes. And this has a budget of £29.5 million in the current year – a budget which has increased each year to help manage the impact of any Council Tax increases on the city's most vulnerable people.

Supplementary question: *County Councillor Walker*

The better-than-expected settlement from the Welsh Government financially came as a surprise to many people. And we know there's an imminent election and there often are better settlements close to elections, strangely.

Do you now foresee that you might be able to adjust the very high figure you had projected for Council Tax increase in the light of the better-than-expected settlement?

Reply: *County Councillor Bale*

I would clearly have to consider a whole range of factors over the next few months. We'll be consulting on the budget – the draft budget – in due course, and will listen to the feedback we hear from members of the public in relation to that as well.

Supplementary question: *County Councillor Mitchell*

Obviously, nobody likes to put Council Tax up. But when we're losing tens and hundreds of millions of pounds over many years, unfortunately, the 1% equates to £1m, which even at 5% is still a drop in the ocean. But I certainly don't like seeing it rise above 3%.

Would you not agree to campaign – or join campaigns – to ask the UK government to claw back some of the £119.4b that goes off-shore in tax-avoidance schemes, tax scams, and offshore trusts?

Reply: *County Councillor Bale*

Clearly, the whole policy of austerity is driven from Westminster. This is something that has happened for many, many years. Over £200m over the last ten years has been taken out of this Council's budget alone. It simply isn't sustainable.

We've seen in England now this 2% levy on Council Tax bills to attempt to try and plug the gap with social-care costs. But that is nowhere near enough for local authorities to meet that. And I think it is going to come to a point very very soon, particularly in England where the level of funding reductions on local government have been so vast, where some critical services are at risk. And we're already seeing that in terms of some of the knock-on impacts on other parts of the public service, including the NHS in England. And I think that's something we all want to avoid. So I'll certainly be doing my best to lobby government in Westminster to make sure that we get the best deal possible and that's redistributed to support public services across the country.

Question: *County Councillor Hunt*

Can the Leader of the Council give an update on the work that is continuing on Llanishen Reservoir?

Reply: *County Councillor Bale*

As you know, bringing forward a high-quality amenity-focussed scheme for Llanishen Reservoir is a priority for the City Council.

Council officers have provided advice to Welsh Water regarding the heritage and ecological aspects of the reservoirs as they seek to fulfil their obligations to make the site safe.

Simultaneously, dialogue is ongoing with Welsh Water to understand their future intentions for the site. They have stated publicly their commitment to opening it up for public access and to examine possible recreational opportunities at the reservoir.

Supplementary question: County Councillor Hunt

I don't know whether the Leader had the opportunity had the opportunity to catch some of the recent Olympics. It was all on at too much of an antisocial hour for me, so I didn't see much of it. But there was – one of our sailing medallists, Hannah Mills, I think learnt to sail on the reservoir. I wonder in the light of that whether there's any sense at the moment that we could have sailing back at the facility?

Reply: County Councillor Bale

You are correct. I understand, having spoken to Hannah Mills' family actually, that Hannah learned in a dinghy on Llanishen Reservoir at a young age and that simply moved on now to an Olympic gold, which is a fantastic achievement of which I'm sure everyone in this chamber would pass on their congratulations to Hannah and her family.

And I'm meeting Welsh Water next week and certainly hoping to open discussions with them as to how we can include some kind of recognition of Hannah's great achievement in the reservoir scheme as that goes forward. And I'll keep you updated.

Supplementary question: County Councillor Walker

I'm sure you will wish to join me in giving our congratulations to the Reservoir Action Group, who really have been at the forefront of making what has happened happen. And they have been supported by members of all political parties and I know you're not trying to capitalise particularly for yourself on all this.

But I think Councillor Hunt has made a very fair point about the sailing, because the sailing in the reservoir did lead not only to Hannah's success, but numbers of British, European, World, and Olympic champions. This is amazing for a tiny stretch of water. So I think it is important for us to recapture that.

My question is when will they be ready to remove the fencing – that horrible metal fencing – that is currently around the site?

Reply: County Councillor Bale

As you may be aware, as I'm sure you read our manifesto, we did give a pledge – a commitment – to campaign and work to reintroduce sailing at Llanishen Reservoir. And that's something that the Labour administration is keen to pursue in the future.

I do take on board your comments about the state of the site at the moment. Welsh Water have been very clear that they don't want to see those sort of physical impediments in the long term. But there are reasons at the moment that they have to restrict access to the site to bring Llanishen Reservoir back into operational use. But once that has happened and after I've had that meeting next week, I'll be in a better

position to update you in terms of the longer-term plans for the regeneration and redevelopment of that area.

Question: *County Councillor Rea*

What is the Council's policy on the maintenance of Council-owned green space which is enclosed and inaccessible to the public?

Reply: *County Councillor Derbyshire*

The Council does not have a formal policy on the maintenance of enclosed and inaccessible land as this issue is addressed on an individual-site basis.

Supplementary question: *County Councillor Rea*

Is it the Council's policy to prioritise those areas where elections are taking place, as there is one particular area in my ward that was cleared but only at election time?

It was given a guarantee to residents when a building was demolished on Cross Street that it would be regularly cleared but it has only happened once, during the Plasnewydd by-election.

Reply: *County Councillor Derbyshire*

I can assure the Councillor that, when we do these things, political nature of the wards is not taken into account one iota.

Supplementary question: *County Councillor Lent*

Can the Cabinet Member confirm that Plasnewydd Labour Councillors and officers have been in dialogue and consultation with local residents on this matter for a number of months?

Reply: *County Councillor Derbyshire*

I am happy to confirm that, Councillor Lent. It is the case that Councillor Rea was referring to the parcel of land and why it was done – I think the reason it was done when it was done when it was, was because of the lobbying by local Councillors to have it tidied up. So the Council was happy to oblige.

Question: *County Councillor Cowan*

How many interim managers do we employ at Operational Manager level and above by Directorate, and how much do we pay each interim manager, and how does that compare to the substantive post comparison salary?

Reply: *County Councillor Hinchey*

The nature of an interim appointment is usually that the individual is not "employed" by the authority as an employee under a contract of employment.

The Council procures interim managers through Commensura, our agency-managed service. Such appointments do not usually benefit from holiday pay, sick leave, or pension contributions, so the pay is higher than the pay for the substantive post to reflect this.

There is currently only one interim manager appointment at the level in this authority, which is the interim Assistant Director for Children's Services. This position is also reflected in pages 58 and 59 of the Council's Statement of Accounts, which was approved by Council last month.

As you will be aware, we have tried on four occasions to recruit to the post. As the responsible Cabinet Member, I am concerned to ensure that we do not make it even harder to recruit good senior staff by putting information in the public arena which encourages criticism of them.

Supplementary question: *County Councillor Cowan*

In order not to embarrass the Council further, I will take the issue up outside the Council Chamber as I know that the number you have quoted is incorrect and I do have written evidence in respect of the number.

Reply: *County Councillor Hinchey*

I welcome that information because Councillor Cowan must have more information from HR Services.

Supplementary question: *County Councillor Lent*

Could the Cabinet Member confirm that the CSSIW recent inspection of Children's Services stressed the importance of stability in this particular area?

Reply: *County Councillor Hinchey*

Absolutely. You are probably more aware than anybody. That CSSIW report gave a very good and positive response to the recent inspection and, therefore, stability over the last four years had been absolutely crucial, particularly given the amount of looked-after children that often come into Cardiff as a resettlement area and the growing pressure around Cardiff.

I think we talked about, at last Council, within a six-week period another 30 children came in as looked-after children. So, absolutely, stability is what we needed.

Question: *County Councillor Gordon*

Are you satisfied that planning guidance in conservation areas is being monitored robustly?

Reply: *County Councillor Michael*

A city-wide review of all 27 conservation areas in Cardiff was completed in 2009.

Each area has an adopted Conservation Area Appraisal to describe its special architectural or historic interest and to help guide development management decisions in order to preserve the area's character and appearance.

Monitoring work and surveys are undertaken regularly and on request when particular enforcement issues or enhancement opportunities arise.

Supplementary question: *County Councillor Gordon*

I've picked up concerns from different conservation areas about contraventions in the conservation areas. And the Victorian Society have offered to try and organise a seminar. I didn't realise there were 27 conservation areas in our city. But they would like to have some feedback about what they think is happening in the conservation areas and I'm just wondering whether you think it'd be best for them to share their findings when they have this meeting with you or whether you'd like the Planning Officers who work in conservation to come to the meeting.

Reply: *County Councillor Michael*

I'm always happy to look at anyone's observations. We robustly keep track with this and there's a slight confusion sometimes with people who think that what they see as a contravention is not actually a contravention. I mean, TAN 9 is the one that actually states that if there's any enforcement to be done, you keep talking until you actually get it right.

But I'm more than happy to meet with Councillor Gordon and meet with Officers to discuss any suggestions you wish to make.

Supplementary question: *County Councillor Boyle*

I'm speaking specifically in relation to the Roath Mill Gardens conservation area, and the guidance on that states that any new building – any *new* buildings – should be designed to harmonise in form and scale with the area and that the first principle of a conservation area is to preserve or enhance its character.

I just wonder, from your experience, how that guidance is interpreted when a new development of obviously contemporary design is proposed within a consistently Edwardian street scene.

How is that modern design generally viewed if it's proposed within an Edwardian conservation area?

Reply: *County Councillor Michael*

I think conservation areas are not something we should actually keep in aspic so that they don't ever change. Conservation areas do change. And one of the things that we like as a planning committee is something radical, something different. And if we get that, we will judge that on its merits and we look at the conservation criteria. So it's not a case of it's a blanket ban.

And it is actually planning guidance and that balance is important to keep. So it's not "its conservation. Therefore, it's aspic – we're not doing any of it." Its planning guidance and we adhere to that.

Question: *County Councillor Woodman*

Could the Cabinet Member please update Council on the work he has done to date to expedite the adoption of new estates by the Council?

Reply: *County Councillor Patel*

The adoption of new roads and public spaces is a priority for the Council to ensure that high standards are achieved in the interest of residents.

However, delays have been experienced on some estates due to difficulties experienced by developers in securing the adoption of drains by Welsh Water. You will be aware that this has been a longstanding problem for the last 10 years or more and is no different to similar delays experienced in other local authorities.

I know that Cabinet Members and officers have been proactive in terms of seeking to promote the resolution of these matters. However, we are constrained by the limited legal powers available to us.

Supplementary Question: *County Councillor Woodman*

I'm very concerned – and I'm sure you share my concern – that residents of Wyncliffe Gardens in Pentwyn have been waiting 10 years, despite local Councillors regularly contacting the Council about this.

Do you think that you can do more with Welsh Water and the developers? Because we've got a lot of new estates going to be built in this city coming forward, east and west. Do you think you could do more to try and get them to take this really seriously and bring about an adoption within a five-year period? It isn't really unreasonable but, for some reason, developers drag it on.

Reply: *County Councillor Patel*

With specific reference to the Wyncliffe Gardens estate in Pentwyn, I can advise you that the adoption of the roads is now quite close. The only outstanding issue is the transfer of the land comprising of two footways to the council and [adjoining?] resident, which are now to be excluded from the works to be adopted. Officers have been advised that the conveyance process for these is now well advanced and completion is fairly imminent.

It is also important to show some successes which have been achieved in recent years. For example, with the adoption of the roads and part of the public open space at the former AWE site in Llanishen. And that's because of the pressures we as Cabinet Members and the Officers have put on the developers.

Question: *County Councillor Hudson*

Can you please outline the cost of both the Caerphilly Road Regeneration Scheme and the A469 Transport & Accessibility Improvement Scheme and what if any penalties are incurred if they overrun their deadlines?

Reply: *County Councillor Patel*

The projected total expenditure on the Birchgrove Shopping Centre regeneration scheme is £228,176.

The projected total expenditure on the A469 Caerphilly Road Local Transport Plan Scheme to implement bus lanes on this arterial route is £2,285,642. This scheme is fully funded by Welsh Government Transport Grant and is being delivered on schedule.

Supplementary question: *County Councillor Hudson*

Can you confirm if some parts of these schemes – and I mean both of them – are flawed and if they've already been changed?

Reply: *County Councillor Patel*

I cannot comment on speculation, unfortunately. I mean, if you're saying something is flawed then I need to know exactly which bits you feel is flawed. And if that's the case, by all means, please contact myself and the Officers and we'll be more than happy to discuss those things.

Supplementary question: *County Councillor Hinchey*

Do you agree that the combined investment by Welsh Government and Council you've just outlined provides new resident bays; improved and safer facilities across the roads, the trees have been improved... Do you agree that, overall, the investment has provided a well overdue, longstanding investment on a key route into Cardiff?

Reply: *County Councillor Patel*

I certainly do, and I've been down Caerphilly Road; and I went down Caerphilly Road before the improvements and I've been down there since the improvements. And I've clearly seen a huge improvement on that.

And this is all about the 50/50 modal shift and the 60/40 modal shift. What we have to do is encourage more and more people to use public transport. And, of course, when you start using the bus lanes, also it's beneficial to the cyclists as well.

And we have got – we've got a corridor which is close to the hospital as well. So, therefore, it's now a real ideal route where people who want to go to the hospital, and also staff who work in the hospital as well, can physically get to that place a lot quicker on the bus route which has been allocated there.

Question: *County Councillor Parry*

Following the £6.5m investment in Active Eastern to make it a real community facility, can the cabinet member for operational property give some examples of other investment by this Labour Council in our buildings across the city, which benefit the people of Cardiff?

Reply: *County Councillor Hinchey*

The Council's five-year property strategy aims to have fewer but better buildings, and seeks to modernise, rationalise, and use buildings collaboratively.

Examples of where we have invested in our operational property include our Hubs across the city. We have provided £8.7m for the new STAR Hub, £1.3m for the Grangetown Hub and £740,000 for the Ely and Caerau Community Hub. In partnership with the Welsh Government, we are also investing £165m in Cardiff schools and our School Organisation Plan, which includes new primary schools and new high schools in the east and west of the city.

We are also investing to reduce the maintenance backlog of our operational properties and £4m of capital funding is made available each year to keep buildings operational. However, we need to continue to manage any such investments to ensure that it remains affordable both now and into the future.

Supplementary question: *County Councillor Parry*

The Eastern Leisure Centre – the newly refurbished Eastern Leisure Centre – and the newly refurbished Rumney Library and Hub are welcome assets now to the people of the east of the city. I think that's all I need to say there.

Reply: *County Councillor Hinchey*

I'm very pleased that one of the local Members is pleased at the modernisation and the services we're providing in the east of the city. Active Eastern, which I think is the new brand that they're using out there, is open and feedback is extremely good so far. And I believe that Councillor Bradbury is about to do an official opening soon and I am sure that he will be inviting you and local Members in the east of the city along to enjoy that.

Question: *County Councillor Sanders*

Excluding children and young people who, for their own protection, need to be placed out of the city, how many looked after children by age, gender, and type of placement including private fostering are, as of the end of September 2016, currently living outside the city?

Reply: *County Councillor Lent*

I can confirm that there were, in total, 223 children placed "out of county" as of 30th September 2016. This includes children who have been placed in neighbouring local authorities.

I would be happy to provide you with a detailed breakdown by age, gender, and type of placement following the meeting.

Regulations do not allow for children to be placed “out of county” in private fostering arrangements. These are the responsibility of the local authority where the private fostering arrangement exists.

Supplementary question: *County Councillor Sanders*

Given the reported increase in looked-after-children numbers, how will you increase capacity in this city so that children and young people remain close to where their support services are?

Reply: *County Councillor Lent*

As Councillor Sanders will be aware, we’ve had a major fostering drive recently. And that is the main way that we are trying to increase capacity. We are particularly wishing to attract foster carers who can take different ages, sibling groups, etc. So we’ve been very much altering our focus to meet the children who we need to accommodate.

Supplementary question: *County Councillor Walker*

Presumably, Councillor, you are looking to reduce that number of “out of county”. Can you tell us something of the progress you’re making in reducing that number, because I know how expensive these things cost? And can you give us some idea of how much they might be costing?

Reply: *County Councillor Lent*

What I can tell you is that, since April, we have returned approximately 10 children from expensive residential placements out of county. And we estimate that we’ve saved approximately £800,000 in doing that.

Question: *County Councillor Rea*

Please set out the details of the Council’s plans and schedule for clearing fallen leaves from streets and pavements over the coming six months.

Reply: *County Councillor Derbyshire*

The Council has a number of teams working together to ensure that appropriate resources are committed to clear the leaf fall from streets and pavements across the city.

There are three key elements to work to clear the leaf fall:

Firstly, tidal parking, where we ask residents along tree-lined streets to move their vehicles in order to facilitate access to kerb channels. The timetable started on 5th September and runs through to 13th December.

Secondly, during the main leaf fall period from 10th October through to 23rd December, we publish a timetable of the areas in which resources are targeted and these main areas are blitzed on a regular basis.

And, thirdly, after the main leaf fall has happened, we will target hotspot areas at risk of surface water flooding, especially when bad weather is predicted in order to reduce leaf build up around drains.

Supplementary question: *County Councillor Rea*

Will the Council be able to provide Members with lists of – if you're writing to residents of particular streets that are going to be cleared, will you be able to provide Members with those lists when they're planned to be cleared so we can consult with residents ourselves?

Reply: *County Councillor Derbyshire*

I'm happy to provide you with the list of streets in your own area if you just want to drop me an email and let me know.

Question: *County Councillor Cowan*

When will wards in Cardiff North receive the same service as the eight inner City wards which receive the rotational cleansing blitz every two months or so?

Reply: *County Councillor Derbyshire*

We have a commitment to improve the cleansing/street environment quality across Cardiff, despite the severe budgetary challenges faced by the Council as a result of the UK Government's austerity agenda. However, it has to be recognised that the issues across the city are not the same.

The service provided in the inner wards is required to be proportionate to needs. This will relate to population density, social differences, and demands placed on areas by commuters. It is felt that the blitz approach in the inner wards provides a service proportionate to needs that is not suitable or needed for outer wards.

The outer wards are receiving additional cleansing supported by two new afternoon teams that support cleansing of the district shopping centres and hotspot locations, in addition to the existing cleansing regime.

Where we become aware of other areas in a ward that require further cleansing, resources are available to carry out one-off visits to address the issue.

Supplementary question: *County Councillor Cowan*

Perhaps you would like to clarify what "social differences" are for us?

And you mentioned the comment about putting additional resources into the district shopping centres in the hotspot areas, which obviously is welcomed, but a number of people from Rhiwbina talk to me about the lack of street cleansing in the individual streets. They pay some of the highest rates of Council Tax in the city and they feel they don't get value for money. So can you look to put additional resources into the side streets, into the streets where people actually live and reside?

Reply: *County Councillor Derbyshire*

I hope you would agree with me that the footfall in some of the side streets in Rhiwbina is not quite the same as it is in the city centre or areas of Cathays where student populations are high.

We have to be realistic about this. It's never been any different when previous administrations were in place. What we have to do is we have to respond where the greatest need is. The greatest need is not in Rhiwbina. However, as I've said to you, if you want to report areas where you feel there is a particular problem, I'm more than happy to get my Officers to come and have a look and see whether we can help.

Question: *County Councillor Clark*

How many illegal building developments have the planning enforcement team determined for demolition/removal in each of the following years:

- 2012/13;
- 2013/14;
- 2014/15; and
- 2015/16?

For each of those years how many of those illegal developments have actually been demolished.

Please could you also provide details of the status of those that have not been demolished?

Reply: *County Councillor Michael*

It's difficult for me to provide you with all this information in the time available to me so I will seek to provide you with this information after the meeting.

What I would say though is that the purpose of planning enforcement action is to overcome an unacceptable breach of planning control.

Therefore, when enforcement action is pursued, it would not necessarily be for the complete demolition of a building. Partial demolition or other alterations in such buildings may be required in order to make them acceptable in planning terms. Any such enforcement action is only taken as a last resort and the primary responsibility of the enforcement function is to negotiate with and advise property owners to ensure that unacceptable development is made acceptable.

I have a full list of information for the years you've asked, which I haven't got time – I've got ten seconds, so I will give that to you after the meeting.

Supplementary question: *County Councillor Clark*

I welcome the fact that I will have that opportunity after the meeting. Will I get them directly after this meeting?

Because I have been asking this question for just 18 months, now. Just a simple identification of how many have been identified for demolition and how many have actually been demolished. But I really do welcome that, if you have got that

information available to me and you can hand it to me after the committee, I really welcome that. Thank you.

Reply: *County Councillor Michael*

I have got the information on my iPad. I am happy to send it to you after the meeting – all the years you’ve asked for, all the details.

Supplementary question: *County Councillor Robson*

Chair of Planning, and also for the Cabinet Member for Planning as well, can we conduct a review into enforcement, just to ensure that once an enforcement notice is served, it is complied with or acted within a timely fashion?

Reply: *County Councillor Michael*

We only sign them as a last resort. And, I think as the answer says, action is taken as a last result we enforce them. The idea of enforcement is to actually go into negotiations.

I quoted earlier on TAN 9 virtually hands it to you. It says it’s inadvisable to take action – enforcement action – while discussions are ongoing.

So, if you want any information, you have access to the Enforcement Officers, and I am happy for you to come in with me to Planning. We can sit there with officers and ask any questions you want.

Question: *County Councillor Cowan*

Can the Cabinet Member advise how many sites have been visited in Cardiff North in the quest to find a site to assist with household recycling, and where are the sites and what are the timescales?

Reply: *County Councillor Hinchey*

Officers have explored sites and buildings across the city, including wards in the north of the city. This has included a thorough review of Council owned assets and properties on the market with the private sector.

I will provide any local ward Members with more details as they emerge. However, when discussing with reusable market experts, it is essential that a site must meet the criteria of both scale and readily accessible location, which is critical for both those who want to donate and those in the community who actually need those reusable items.

Supplementary question: *County Councillor Cowan*

Thank you for the statement, but basically the question talks about “where are the sites and what are the timescales?” We made some comments and Councillor Derbyshire did, at the last meeting that Wedal Road wouldn’t close until certain criteria had been met, which obviously is very welcomed. But we’re not getting any

substantive information. We have no idea of the timescale – are we looking at a week or are we looking at ten years? Can you give us some indication, please?

Reply: *County Councillor Hinchey*

At this particular time, no. We've engaged some of the third-party providers who are already supplying some of those types of reuse – you know, companies like Track 2000, British Heart Foundation, and Groundworks are another well-established group in South Wales.

So Councillor Derbyshire and I have been talking to them about what their needs are, what their outlooks are in terms of helping people and establishing the type of structure we will want. We certainly above 15000 square feet, for example, given the capacity and size of Cardiff.

So, at the moment, we are looking at a number of properties but we're not at the point where we can disclose particular locations.

Can I ask as well – perhaps I can be a bit cheeky, Councillor Cowan – if you've got some particular HWRC potential sites in Rhiwbina, perhaps you'd like to come forward?

Supplementary question: *County Councillor Clark*

Please could you clarify whether Wedal Road Recycling Centre will remain open until before or after a new Cardiff north recycling centre opens?

Reply: *County Councillor Hinchey*

First, I'd like to point out that Wedal Road won't close until we've got all those alternatives that we said and promised in place.

We're talking about a *reusable* centre. And I guess if I can describe it from our trips to see some other likewise establishments around South Wales, there are a huge number of students – growing number of students – who regularly purchase items and, dare I say, they end up being discarded at the end of term. And parents, like us, who have sent off students, go and rebuy all that stuff. But there are certainly areas around Cardiff where items can be, with a little bit of tender love and care, be repaired and put back into good use so they don't end up either being fully recycled or going to landfill.

Question: *County Councillor Lloyd*

Could the Cabinet Member please tell me when the weeping willow that fell into Roath Park Lake almost a year ago will be removed and will it be replaced?

Reply: *County Councillor Derbyshire*

We anticipate these works will be undertaken and a replacement tree planted by the end of the calendar year.

Supplementary question: *County Councillor Lloyd*

I accepted the spring reason for not felling the tree then. I was told that things were nesting in it. Well, fair enough, I suppose. I know over the summer they've been busy, but surely by now – it is coming up to its first birthday after all – surely it should have been felled by now. It's unsightly to the park users over the summer. Is the monitoring process, if that's what it's called, robust enough now that the Parkwood have taken over the management of a lot of the parks? Is the monitoring robust enough to ensure that our parks are adequate and can remain beautiful for the people who visit them?

Reply: *County Councillor Derbyshire*

I think you got a bit confused about Parkwood. They don't deal with the tree issue at all – that's still within Parks, and I intend for it to remain that way.

The issue has been for us, I think we have to look at priorities here, as always. We've got a relatively small tree team. They deal not just with the trees in parks but on housing estates and on the highway. So we have quite a big responsibility there. And I think the shame of it all is of course that it was vandalism that caused it in the first place, which is terrible to know about.

But what we have to look at is the condition of the tree, whether it becomes a danger to public safety, and also the situation at the time. As you pointed out yourself, there was some delay because of nesting, etc. But also the condition of the tree – it didn't present any danger to the public, even if it might have been a little bit unsightly. And, therefore, it had to wait its turn in terms of prioritising and making sure that, where there were trees that were in danger of coming down and affecting people, that that would have been a problem for us.

So I can assure you, as I say, it is going to be done by the end of the calendar year, and it will be replaced on a like-for-like basis with a weeping willow known as *Salix babylonica*.

95 : URGENT BUSINESS

None

96 : CONSTITUTION COMMITTEE: ASSISTANT TO CABINET MEMBERS -
ROLE DESCRIPTIONS

The Council was requested to approve the recommendation of the Constitution Committee 21 September, 2016 in relation to the Assistants to Cabinet Member role descriptions.

RESOLVED – That

- (1) the amendment of Article 7.5 of the Constitution to include the Role Description for Assistants to Cabinet Members as set out in the report was approved

- (2) the Monitoring Officer be requested to make the necessary amendments to the Constitution arising from resolution (1) above; and
- (3) the approved Role Descriptions be circulated by the Monitoring Officer to all Assistants to Cabinet Members.

97 : COMMITTEE MEMBERSHIP

The Council received a report identifying the current Committee vacancies and the Party Group nominations to vacancies on Committee had been include on the amendment sheet.

RESOLVED – That

1. Councillor Murphy be appointed to fill the vacancy on the Planning Committee;
2. Councillor Huw Thomas be appointed to fill the vacancy on the Council Appeals Committee.

98 : NOMINATIONS TO OUTSIDE BODIES

The Council was requested to agree the appointment of Council representatives to Outside Bodies under the Local Choice functions in accordance with nominations received from Party Groups as set out on the amendment sheet.

RESOLVED that the following nominations as City of Cardiff representatives on outside bodies be approved:

<u>Name of Organisation</u>	<u>Nominated Representative</u>
Cardiff & Vale of Glamorgan Community Health Council	Mr Gareth Williams
South Wales Fire & Rescue Authority	Councillor Manzoor Ahmed

(Meeting closed at 20.50pm)

99 : WRITTEN QUESTIONS

ENVIRONMENT QUESTION

Written Question: *County Councillor Walker*

The Environmental Legislation April 2016 requires public bodies to achieve a biodiverse environment. What actions have so far been taken by the Council in response to this legislation and what future proposals are planned?

Reply: *County Councillor Derbyshire*

As Cardiff's Biodiversity Champion, I have been facilitating more wildlife areas in our parks and open spaces; several of which have been seeded with wild flowers to

encourage pollinators. I have also attended and chair meetings of Cardiff's Biodiversity Partnership and meet regularly with the RSPB and other groups and bodies to explore ways to make Cardiff a more biodiverse city. The Environment (Wales) Act 2016 requires that public bodies, such as the City of Cardiff Council, seek to maintain and enhance biodiversity and, in doing so, promote the resilience of ecosystems in the exercise of their functions.

Chair: _____

Date: _____